

# Appeal Update Report

Date: September 2023

Planning Appeals

Report of the Director of Planning

Cabinet Member: Councillor CW Horncastle

#### **Purpose of report**

For Members' information to report the progress of planning appeals. This is a monthly report and relates to appeals throughout all 5 Local Area Council Planning Committee areas and covers appeals of Strategic Planning Committee.

#### Recommendations

<u>To note</u> the contents of the report in respect of the progress of planning appeals that have been submitted to and determined by the Planning Inspectorate.

#### **Link to Corporate Plan**

This report is relevant to all of the priorities included in the NCC Corporate Plan 2018-2021 where identified within individual planning applications and appeals.

#### **Key issues**

Each planning application and associated appeal has its own particular set of individual issues and considerations that have been taken into account in their determination, which are set out within the individual application reports and appeal decisions.



## Recent Planning Appeal Decisions

### Planning Appeals Allowed (permission granted)

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
18/03394/REM	Reserved Matters Application relating to 16/00078/OUT - Development of Phase 1 of proposals which include Trunk Road Service Area, Hotel and Innovation Centre plus associated access, parking, landscaping and other associated infrastructure – land west of Lancaster Park, Pinewood Drive, Lancaster Park, Morpeth	Yes – claim for full costs allowed
	Main issues: the design fails to preserve or make a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness, and the site's surroundings, and fails to create or contribute to a strong sense of place. The development does not demonstrate high quality sustainable design, is not visually attractive, does not incorporate high quality materials and detailing, and is substantially altered from the approved outline planning application.	
	Committee Decision - Officer Recommendation: Approve	
22/00913/FUL	Resubmission of approval 18/03632/REM for the construction of two detached dwellings and associated works – land to north west of Blue House Farm Cottages, Blue House Farm Road, Netherton Colliery	No
	Maini issues: isolated residential development in the open countryside; and no planning obligation secured in respect of a contribution to the Coastal Mitigation Service or other alternative mitigation.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/00437/FUL	Change of use of land from equestrian grazing use to campsite use – land north east of Bolam Lake Boat House Wood Car Park, Belsay	No – claim refused
	Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	

### **Planning Appeals Split Decision**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

### Planning Appeals Dismissed (permission refused)

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
22/03696/FUL	Retrospective application for works carried out to add pillars with metal railings between at front boundary wall; stone face side wall between front and rear garden and construction of raised timber deck – Woodstock, Mill Lane, Haltwhistle	No
	Main issues: harm to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area; and harmful impact on residential amenity.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/04507/FUL	Demolition of existing ground floor rear extension and replacement with two storey rear extension – The Coach House, Fenwicks Close Farm, Earsdon	No
	Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt; and disproportionate addition that would be incongruous with the character of the area.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
21/04208/FUL	Proposal to erect a single self-build dwelling house – land south west of Hazeldene Cottage, Sinderhope	No
	Main issues: isolated development in the open countryside in an unsustainable location; fails to conserve and enhance the natural beauty and scenic qualities of the North Pennines AONB; visibility splays from the access are inadequate; insufficient information to assess ecological impacts; and insufficient information regarding foul water drainage.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/01812/FUL	Proposed detached single storey garage and store with associated formation of driveway – Eland Close,	No – claim

	Eland Land, Ponteland	refused
	Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt and the open countryside	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/04124/FUL	Erection of stables, tackroom and associated horse paddock – land east of Oakfield Lodge, Eachwick	No
	Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt; and visually intrusive and harmful impact on the character and appearance of the site and surrounding landscape.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/04369/FUL	Proposed replacement windows – 6 Albert Place, Berwick-upon-Tweed	No
	Main issues: fails to conserve and enhance the significance of the Conservation Area; and results in harm to the Conservation Area that is not outweighed by public benefits.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
21/02696/S106A	Variation of S106 Agreement relating to planning permission A/2004/0323 dated 3rd February 2005 – Hawkshaw, Old Swarland, Swarland	No
	Main issues: the S106 continues to serve a useful purpose and insufficient information has been submitted to demonstrate that there is no longer a requirement for discount market value accommodation for a local person(s) in the area.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/03911/FUL	Proposal for a new family 1.5 storey dwelling with a garage, external parking and associated services - (Self Build) - 7 Springfield Meadows, Alnwick	No – claim refused
	Main issues: design and visual appearance; and fails to secure a contribution towards coastal mitigation measures.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	

22/04665/FUL	Proposed first floor extension over existing sun room and installation of a fixed window to the southern gable wall at high level – 63 Merley Gate, Loansdean, Morpeth  Main issues: the extension would constitute an incongruous addition that would be out of character with the dwelling and built context; and harmful impact upon residential amenity.	No
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/00637/FUL	Alterations and extension – 2 West Hedgeley, Powburn  Main issues: design would be out of scale and character with the existing property and surrounding area, and would harm the setting of Grade II listed buildings	No
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
21/04592/FUL	Demolition of 2 no. youth hostel cabins and erection of 8 no. caravan pitches and children's play area (as amended) - Hareshaw Linn Caravan Park, Bellingham	No
	Main issues: harmful visual impacts on the character and appearance of the site and surrounding area; and harmful impacts on residential amenity.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/04246/FUL	Proposed single storey garage extension including a study and a shower room – 57 Church Street, Amble Main issues: scale and design results in adverse impact on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and the surrounding area.	No
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	

### **Planning Appeals Withdrawn**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

### **Planning Casework Unit Referrals**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

## Planning Appeals Received

### **Appeals Received**

Reference No	Description and address	Appeal start date and decision level
21/03396/FUL	Construction of 3no. residential cottages with associated garages, access, car parking and landscaping and demolition of existing outbuilding(s) and extension(s) to 4 & 5 Front Street with replacement extension(s) and internal alterations - 4 and 5 Front Street, Capheaton	2 November 2022 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
	Main issues: proposals are not commensurate with the size of the settlement and encroach into the open countryside, adversely impacting on the setting and appearance of the settlement and surrounding countryside; proposals result in harm to the heritage assets and their setting without clear and convincing justification of this harm or public benefits to outweigh the harm; layout, scale and design as well as pattern of development would be detrimental to local vernacular and character; lack of information on car parking, access arrangements, refuse, drainage and opportunities to promote walking, cycling and public transport; and proposals result in biodiversity net loss.	
21/03397/LBC	Listed Building Consent for demolition of existing outbuilding(s) and extension(s) to 4 & 5 Front Street with replacement extension(s), internal alterations and alterations to boundary walls – 4 and 5 Front Street, Capheaton	2 November 2022 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
	Main issues: proposals result in harm to the heritage assets without clear and convincing	

	justification of this harm or public benefits to	
	outweigh the harm.	
21/01833/FUL	Development of 60 no. Pitches for holiday accommodation comprising touring caravan/campervan pitches and tents – land at Elwick Farm, Belford	10 January 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer
	Main issues: unsustainable major tourism in the open countryside; lack of information in relation to impacts on wildlife; lack of information in respect of a nutrient calculation relating to the Lindisfarne SPA; and lack of information relating to surface water drainage and highways.	Recommendation: Refuse
21/02287/FUL	Convert and extend redundant cow byre to residential use (C3) for holiday let – Waterside Cottage, Acklington	25 January 2023 Delegated
	Main issues: development in an unsustainable location within the open countryside; insufficient information to justify non-mains foul drainage; insufficient information to demonstrate the proposal would not sterilise and identified sand and gravel resource; absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC; and loss of ancient woodland with no exceptional circumstances or suitable compensation strategy.	Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/03609/AGTRES	Notification of Prior Approval to convert an existing but now redundant agricultural building on the Guyzance Estate for permanent residential use – land south of Waterside Cottage, Acklington	25 January 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation:
	Main issues: impacts on adjacent ancient semi-natural woodland and River Coquet and Coquet Valley Woodland SSSI; and absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC.	Refuse
22/04634/FUL	Demolition of detached garage and construction of side extension – Middlesteads Farm, Longhirst	16 February 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer
	Main issues: design does not respect the character of the existing dwelling or its locality, would fail to remain subordinate and would result in unacceptable adverse impact on the character of the dwelling and its	Recommendation:

	setting.	
22/01297/FUL	Development of 4 no. residential dwellings including associated access, landscaping and all other ancillary works – land north of junction of Station Road, South End, Longhoughton  Main issues: would fail to preserve the setting of the Grade I listed Church of St Peter and St Paul; harmful impact on the character and appearance of the area; and absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC.	21 February 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/02704/CLEXIS	Certificate of Lawful Development – Existing use for the siting of a caravan for residential purposes – land north of east of South Linden House, Longhorsley  Main issues: it is not possible to conclude that the building has been used for a continuous period of 4 years as a dwelling.	27 February 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/03417/OUT	Outline application with some matters reserved for development of one residential dwelling (Self Build); all matters reserved other than access – land north of Hill Top Cottage, Morpeth  Main issues: development within the open countryside; inappropriate development in the open countryside; fails to promote the use of sustainable travel; fails to demonstrate that safe access can be achieved; and fails to demonstrate potential impacts on protected species and how these can be mitigated.	21 March 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/03876/FUL	A storage shed and polytunnel to support existing woodland maintenance – land at south east of Pit Allotment Wood, Corbridge Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt.	16 May 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/01012/FUL	Conversion of agricultural buildings to create one dwelling including a link extension and detached garage – development site at Barley Hill House Barn, Kiln Pit Hill, Consett Main issues: design fails to reflect the character or appearance of the listed farm building and results in harm to the character and appearance of the listed building.	17 May 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse

Erection of a forestry shelter and the location of a storage container (retrospective) - land east of Aydon Dipton Woods, Corbridge  Main issues: development in the open	23 May 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer
Main issues: development in the open	
countryside and inappropriate development in the Green Belt.	Recommendation:
Erection 2no 2-storey 4 bed detached dwellings (validated 06/01/23, notice served) - land south west of 21 Front Street, East Bedlington	26 May 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer
Main issues: fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to demonstrate appropriate off-street car parking provision; fails to demonstrate that appropriate ground gas protection has been incorporated into the development; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; and absence of completed planning obligation securing a contribution to the Council's Coastal Mitigation Scheme or other suitable mitigation to address effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Northumberland Shore SSSI.	Recommendation: Refuse
Outline planning permission for residential	5 June 2023
development for up to four dwellings (All Matters Reserved) with demolition of existing structures - resubmission of application 19/01511/OUT - land at Moor Farm Estate, Station Road, Stannington	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
Main issues: proposal would permanently urbanise an open site to the detriment of the rural, dispersed, open character of the site and its surroundings.	
Construction of 8no. bungalows with	7 June 2023
<ul> <li>associated access, parking and landscaping</li> <li>land north of Hartford Court, East West</li> <li>Link Road, Cramlington</li> </ul>	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation:
Main issues: loss of open space; design, density, siting and layout does not respect the character of the area or contribute to a strong sense of place; impacts on residential amenity; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to promote the use of sustainable travel within the	Refuse
	Erection 2no 2-storey 4 bed detached dwellings (validated 06/01/23, notice served) - land south west of 21 Front Street, East Bedlington  Main issues: fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to demonstrate appropriate off-street car parking provision; fails to demonstrate that appropriate ground gas protection has been incorporated into the development; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; and absence of completed planning obligation securing a contribution to the Council's Coastal Mitigation Scheme or other suitable mitigation to address effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Northumberland Shore SSSI.  Outline planning permission for residential development for up to four dwellings (All Matters Reserved) with demolition of existing structures - resubmission of application 19/01511/OUT - land at Moor Farm Estate, Station Road, Stannington  Main issues: proposal would permanently urbanise an open site to the detriment of the rural, dispersed, open character of the site and its surroundings.  Construction of 8no. bungalows with associated access, parking and landscaping – land north of Hartford Court, East West Link Road, Cramlington  Main issues: loss of open space; design, density, siting and layout does not respect the character of the area or contribute to a strong sense of place; impacts on residential amenity; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to promote the

	T	·
	planning obligation securing a contribution to the Council's Coastal Mitigation Scheme or other suitable mitigation to address effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Northumberland Shore SSSI.	
22/03128/FUL	Proposed construction of 3 bedroom dormer bungalow – land south east of 4 Studley Drive, Swarland	13 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer
	Main issues: loss of landscaping and detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the area; and subdivision of the plot would have a harmful impact on the character and appearance of the area.	Recommendation: Refuse
23/00732/FUL	Retrospective - Proposed full timber decking outdoor seating area with timber frame outbuilding / shed for outdoor store and service area – The Schooner Hotel, 8 Northumberland Street, Alnmouth	15 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:
	Main issues: harm to heritage asset and no public benefits have been demonstrated to outweigh the identified harm.	Refuse
22/01992/OUT	Outline permission (all matters reserved) for erection of 1no. dwellinghouse with granny annex (C3 use class) - land north west and south east of The Haven, Back Crofts, Rothbury  Main issues: fails to address highway safety matters in relation to site access and manoeuvrability.	19 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
23/01214/VARYCO	Removal of condition 3 (Footpath 1 (HDM)) and 4 (Footpath 2 (HDM)) on approved application 21/04875/FUL - land north of Southcroft Stables, The Croft, Ulgham Main issues: the proposed removal would not promote sustainable connectivity between the wider development and existing infrastructure.	26 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/04676/LBC	Listed Building Consent for alterations comprising inserting one window with shutter in South facing gable wall, and the replacement of existing window with fully glazed panel and shutter on West elevation (Amended Description) - The Cottage, Riding Home Farm, Acomb, Hexham  Main issues: less than substantial harm to the character and significance of the listed building that has not been justified.	27 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
23/01138/ADE	Advertisement consent for 1no. totem sign –	5 July 2023

	Lidl, Hexham Gate Retail Park, Hexham	Delegated
	Main issues: harm to the visual amenity of the site and wider area, including the setting of designated heritage assets and the townscape.	Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/04675/FUL	Proposed 1.5 storey extension to the rear will provide a new staircase; two extensions onto the west gable will provide two storeys of additional living accommodation, plus a single storey link to the updated outbuilding to be clad in timber; the two storey and 1.5 storey extensions to have roof pitches; double garage with timber clad; the landscape and ground levels will be updated to provide access to the garage and accommodate the extensions The Hott, Thorngrafton, Hexham	17 July 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
	Main issues: design would not be in keeping with the traditional character and appearance of the dwelling, existing buildings and surrounding area and would be detrimental to visual amenity and fails to preserve the significance of non-designated heritage assets; and insufficient information to consider the archaeological impacts of the development.	
22/04104/FUL	Change of use, conversion and alteration of the existing buildings to create 6 holiday let units, including landscaping and boundary treatments – 58-60 Middle Street, Spittal Main issues: lack of detail in respect of parking and ecology; and design has not been informed by a structural survey and results in harm to heritage assets.	18 July 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/04526/FUL	Erection of single dwelling with associated access and residential garden – land southeast of The Courtyard, Matfen  Main issues: unsustainable and isolated location within the open countryside; insufficient information to fully consider the ecological impacts of the proposal; and insufficient information to fully consider the impact on existing trees.	16 August 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
23/00494/FUL	Removal of conservatory to west elevation and construction of two storey side and rear extensions and raising of ridge height – 32 Linden Way, Darras Hall, Ponteland Main issues: inappropriate design with detrimental impact on the character and	17 August 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse

	visual appearance of the existing dwelling and street scene.	
20/00230/FUL	Full planning permission for 63 no. dwellings with associated infrastructure and landscaping (as amended) - land south of Broomhouse Lane, Station Road, Prudhoe	17 August 2023 Committee Decision – Officer Recommendation: Approve
	Main issues: insufficient information to demonstrate that the development would deliver an appropriate mix of housing to meet local housing need; new access with associated disturbance and visual impacts would have a harmful impact on the character and visual amenity of the area and the amenity and living conditions of residents; and insufficient information in respect of energy efficiency measures.	
22/03923/FUL	Proposed first floor extension to dwelling house (as amended 25.05.2023) - 14 Castle Street, Norham	18 August 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer
	Main issues: the development fails to Rec	Recommendation: Refuse
22/04546/CLEXIS	Certificate of existing lawful development for the siting of a twin unit caravan for ancillary	24 August 2023
	residential use as an annexe within the existing residential curtilage – Old Field, Catton, Hexham	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation:
	Main issues: the caravan is not within the residential curtilage so would require planning permission and would have a significant degree of permanency constituting development – the caravan would not be lawful.	Refuse

## Recent Enforcement Appeal Decisions

### **Enforcement Appeals Allowed**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
None		

### **Enforcement Appeals Dismissed**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
None		

### **Enforcement Appeals Withdrawn**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
None		

## **Enforcement Appeals Received**

### **Appeals Received**

Reference No	Description and address	Appeal start date
22/00022/NOTICE	Unauthorised dwelling – Horsley Banks Farm, Horsley	6 April 2022 Hearing date: 22 November 2022
22/00023/NOTICE	Unauthorised stable buildings – Horsley Banks Farm, Horsley	6 April 2022 Hearing date: 22 November 2022
20/00481/ENDEVT	Change of use of a forestry building for use as residential - English/Wheelings Wood, Corbridge	2 March 2023
21/00865/BRCOND	Construction of retaining wall – Woodlands Rise, Corbridge Road, Hexham	23 March 2023
22/01092/COU	Construction of a multi use arena, erection of an animal shelter and provision of gravelled parking area	25 April 2023
21/00080/ENDEVT	Installation of hardcore - land to north of Kiln Cottage, Newton-on-the-Moor	13 June 2023

## Inquiry and Hearing Dates

Reference No	Description and address	Inquiry/hearing date and decision level
21/02077/FUL	Proposed construction of 13no dwellings (including 2no affordable dwellings), creation of new access, car parking and soakaways (amended description) - land south east of The Manor House, Riding Mill  Main issues: harm to the character and appearance of the site and surrounding area and curtilage listed boundary wall; harm to residential amenity; does not make sufficient provision for affordable housing on the site; insufficient information to fully assess the impacts of the proposed development on ecology and biodiversity and net gain for biodiversity; does not secure necessary planning obligations in respect of affordable housing, open space and education.	Hearing – 12 September 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
21/03915/LBC	Listed Building Consent for demolition of a section of existing curtilage listed boundary wall to create access for residential development – land south east of The Manor House, Riding Mill  Main issues: loss of historic fabric and unacceptable alteration of the historic curtilage listed boundary wall.	Hearing 12 September 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
19/01362/REM	Reserved matters application for appearance, landscaping, layout and scale for proposed 150 residential dwellings (use class C3) including 30% affordable housing, countryside park including car park, pursuant to approved outline planning application 16/00078/OUT (revised description 8th August 2022) - land west of Lancaster Park, Pinewood Drive, Lancaster Park, Morpeth Main issues: by virtue of the layout, scale and appearance, the design fails to preserve or make a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness and the site's surroundings and does not demonstrate high quality sustainable design; and there is no effective and safe access and egress to the existing transport network.	Hearing – 30 August 2023 Committee Decision - Officer Recommendation: Approve

### **Implications**

Policy	Decisions on appeals may affect future interpretation of policy and influence policy reviews
Finance and value for money	There may be financial implications where costs are awarded by an Inspector or where Public Inquiries are arranged to determine appeals
Legal	It is expected that Legal Services will be instructed where Public Inquiries are arranged to determine appeals
Procurement	None
Human resources	None
Property	None
Equalities (Impact Assessment attached?)  □ Yes  √ No □ N/a	Planning applications and appeals are considered having regard to the Equality Act 2010
Risk assessment	None
Crime and disorder	As set out in individual reports and decisions
Customer consideration	None
Carbon reduction	Each application/appeal may have an impact on the local environment and have been assessed accordingly
Wards	All where relevant to application site relating to the appeal

#### **Background papers**

Planning applications and appeal decisions as identified within the report.

#### Report author and contact details

Elizabeth Sinnamon Development Service Manager Elizabeth.Sinnamon@northumberland.gov.uk